

# Water Supply Roadmap – Proposed Shortlist for Conveyance BOARD OF DIRECTORS

April 2, 2024



#### **Overview**

- Conveyance in the Context of the Roadmap
- Project Goal and Criteria
- Summary of Conveyance alternatives
- Screening of alternatives
- Proposed Shortlist
- Phasing of projects
- Next Steps

### **Roadmap for Integrated Strategy**



# **Integrated Approach Provides Flexibility**



#### **Project Goal and Evaluation Criteria**

- The goal of the Project is to enhance the reliability, flexibility and resiliency of the water system to improve service to Marin Water customers.
- Proposed Evaluation Criteria are project characteristics that allow us to differentiate between project alternatives
- Typically alternatives are scored for each criterion and the highest scores represent the best alternatives

### **Evaluation Criteria**

- Water Reliability and Sustainability
- Flexibility and Resiliency
- Schedule and Implementation
- Water Quality
- Environmental and Social Stewardship
- Economic and Financial

### **Project Alternatives**

Description	Alternative	Details of Alternative	Length (miles)
	STS-1	along 101 Corridor	10.5
Cotati Tanks to Kastania PS	STS-2	through downtown Petaluma	12.1
	STS-3	through rural roads	15.5
	STAF-1	to Nicasio Reservoir	8.0
Stafford Lake area to MMWD Lake(s)	STAF-2	to Soulajule Reservoir	6.8
	STAF-3	to Nicasio and Soulajule Reservoir	11.0
	PETA-1	to Nicasio Reservoir	13.2
North Marin Aqueduct to MMWD	PETA-2	to Soulajule Reservoir	12.0
Lake(s)	PETA-3	to Nicasio and Soulajule Reservoir	16.2
	PETA-4	to Nicasio and Soulajule Reservoir via San Antonio Road	14.8
	COTATI-1	to Nicasio Reservoir	24.2
Cotati Tanks to MMWD Lake(s)	COTATI-2	to Soulajule Reservoir	20.5
	COTATI-3	to Nicasio and Soulajule Reservoir	25.9

#### **Southern Transmission System (STS)**



#### **Stafford Transmission System (STAF)**



#### Petaluma Aqueduct System (PETA)



#### **Cotati Transmission System (COTATI)**



### **Project Alternatives**

Description	Alternative	Details of Alternative	Length (miles)	Max MGD	Cost (\$M)
	STS-1	along 101 Corridor	10.5	0	\$148
Cotati Tanks to Kastania PS	STS-2	through downtown Petaluma	12.1	0	\$163
	STS-3	through rural roads	15.5	0	\$200
Stafford Lake area to MMWD Lake(s)	STAF-1	to Nicasio Reservoir	8.0	3-7	\$63
	STAF-2	to Soulajule Reservoir	6.8	3-7	\$56
	STAF-3	to Nicasio and Soulajule Reservoir	11.0	3-7	\$77
	PETA-1	to Nicasio Reservoir	13.2 12.0	10	\$111
				14	\$144
North Marin Aqueduct to MMWD Lake(s)	PETA-2	to Soulajule Reservoir		10 14	\$105 \$135
		to Nicesia and Caulainla Decembrin	16.2	11	\$129
	PETA-3	to Nicasio and Sourajule Reservoir	16.2	14	\$196
		to Nicasio and Soulajule Reservoir via San	1/1 8	13	\$148
	FLIA-4	Antonio Road	14.0	26	\$378
Cotati Tanks to MMWD Lake(s)	COTATI-1	to Nicasio Reservoir	24.2	30	\$364
	COTATI-2	to Soulajule Reservoir	20.5	30	\$322
	COTATI-3	to Nicasio and Soulajule Reservoir	25.9	30	\$380

# Evaluation Criteria: (Draft) Scoring of Alternatives

PHASE 1 ALTERNATIVES EVALUATION WITH WEIGHTING								
Criteria	Water Supply Benefit	Water Reliability and Sustainability	Flexibility and Resiliency	Schedule and Implementation	Water Quality	Environmental and Social Stewardship	Economic and Financial	Total Score
Criteria Weighting	5	4	4	3	2	2	4	
STS-1	1	1	2	2	3	2	2	41
STS-2	1	1	2	2	3	2	2	41
STS-3	1	1	2	2	3	3	2	43
STAF-1	1	1	2	2	3	2	2	41
STAF-2	1	1	2	2	3	2	2	41
STAF-3	1	1	2	2	3	2	2	41
PETA-1	2	2	2	2	3	2	2	50
PETA-2	2	2	2	2	3	2	2	50
PETA-3	3	2	3	3	3	2	2	62
PETA-4	4	3	3	3	3	2	2	71
COTATI-1	3	3	2	2	3	2	1	55
COTATI-2	3	3	2	2	3	2	1	55
COTATI-3	4	3	2	3	3	2	1	63

Proposed Shortlist of Projects for Further Analysis

## **Potential Shortlist of Projects For Deeper Analysis**

- PETA-3
- PETA-4
- COTATI-3

# **PETA-3 Alternative**

- 10 mgd Water Supply Benefit
  - No Add'l Improvements
- 14 mgd Water Supply Benefit
  - Increase Kastania PS capacity and increase NMWD Aqueduct velocity to 8.7 fps



# **PETA-4 Alternative**

- 13.0mgd Water Supply Benefit
  - No Add'l Improvements
- 26 mgd Water Supply Benefit
  - Construct STS
  - Increase Kastania PS capacity



# **COTATI-3 Alternative**

- 30 mgd Water Supply Benefit
  - Allows design for District needs



# Summary of Attributes Shared by Top Alternatives

- All of the top alternatives address the project goal by enhancing drought reliability
- The top alternatives are the most flexible version of a cluster of alternatives:
  - PETA 3, PETA 4 are the best of the PETA options
  - PETA 3 includes STAF options, PETA 4 includes STS options
  - COTATI 3 is the best of the COTATI options
- All of the alternatives permit a degree of phasing and optionality

# Phasing Over Time: PETA 3 Example





#### **Capacity and Capital Cost Over Time**



#### **Next Steps**

- Develop shortlist projects in greater detail:
  - Refine alignment
  - Study environmental constraints
  - Refine lifecycle cost
- Evaluate yield, and benefit, through modeling & partner collaboration
- Return to the Board in May 2024 for an update on Conveyance
- Continue updates on Storage project
- Identify preferred projects later in the summer